Real Interest Rates, Bubbles and Monetary Policy in the GCC countries

Elmostafa Bentour Weshah Razzak

API/WPS 0912

Correspondence

Dr.Elmostafa Bentour, The Arab Planning Institute, P.O. Box: 5834 Safat. 13059 Kuwait, Tel: (965) 4843130, Fax: (965) 4842935, E-mail: mostafa@api.org.kw.

Dr.Weshah Razzak, The Arab Planning Institute, P.O. Box: 5834 Safat. 13059 Kuwait, Tel: (965) 4843130, Fax: (965) 4842935, E-mail: weshah@api.org.kw.

Real Interest Rates, Bubbles and Monetary Policy in the GCC countries

Elmostafa Bentour Weshah Razzak

Abstract

The Gulf Cooperation Council countries (GCC) include Bahrain, Kuwait, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia and the UAE. Their monetary policy objective is to stabilize the foreign price, i.e., exchange rate instead of the domestic price level, where the nominal interest rate is equalized with the US federal fund rate, but the inflation rates are independent. High oil prices and the depreciating US dollar caused inflation to rise and real interest rates to be persistently negative in the UAE and Qatar. Asset prices bubbles formed then burst creating large loses. They could have moderated the effect of, or avoided, the bubble had they floated the currency and stabilized domestic prices.



إن أهداف السياسة النقدية لدول مجلس التعاون الخليجي هي استقرار سعر الصرف للدولار الأمريكي (ما عدا الكويت التي لديها نفس الهدف تجاه سلة من العملات) بدلاً من استقرار أسعار السلع والخدمات المحلية. لتحقيق هذا الهدف تقوم البنوك المركزية بتغيير سعر الفائدة الاسمي القصير الأجل كلما تغير سعر الفائدة على الدولار بطريقة أو بأخرى، ولكن التضخم النقدي في دول الخليج مستقلاً تماماً عن ذاك في الولايات المتحدة الأمريكية. إن ارتفاع أسعار النفط وانخفاض قيمة الدولار تجاه العملات الأخرى أدى إلى تضخم نقدي في أغلب دول مجلس التعاون في السنوات السابقة ولذلك فقد أصبح سعر الفائدة الحقيقي سلبياً في الإمارات العربية المتحدة وقطر. مما أدى إلى ظهور فقاعات في أسعار الأصول وخصوصاً في العقار تبعها انخفاض هائل في الأسعار. ربما كانت قد استطاعت هاتين الدولتين من معالجة المشكلة إذا كانت قد اتبعت سياسة نقدية تهدف إلى تجنب التضخم النقدي. لأن مشكلة التضخم النقدي لها مساس مباشر فقاعات أسعار الأصول.

1. Introduction

The fixed exchange rate regime was unsustainable in the US because of balance of payments problems. Friedman (1953) made the case for flexible exchange rates. The US floated the dollar in 1973. Other Western nations followed suit. Speculators attacked the Bank of England and forced it to exit the European Exchange Rate Mechanism in 1992.

Hong Kong has a currency board vis-à-vis the USD; it feels safe from potential attacks, most likely because the Bank of China's massive reserves deter speculators. Further, asset price bubbles have higher chances forming under fixed exchange rate regimes where $i_t = i_t^*$, and if $\pi_t > \pi_t^*$ and $r_t < 0$ (see appendix for data and notation). Figure 1 illustrates using Hong Kong data (the correlation is -0.75). During the period from the 1990-1999, $\bar{r}_t < 0$, π_t was 6.87 percent and π_t^* was 3 percent. High inflation is bad, in addition to eroding purchasing powers, increasing the variability of relative prices, and distorting real decisions, excess money and credit fuel the asset markets. Central banks can stabilize the foreign price (fix the exchange rate) or stabilize the domestic prices (e.g., inflation targeting), but not both.

The GCC adopt a fixed exchange rate regime to the US dollar (except Kuwait which pegs to a basket), where i_t is set equal to i_t^* , to keep the depreciation rate constant. Inflation in the GCC is usually imported, and highly associated with high oil prices and loose US monetary policy.

The IMF article IV consultation 2008 shows that the UAE had negative real interest rates persisted for years. Qatar too had a persistent negative real interest rate. Oman's rate became negative in 2007-2008. The other GCC countries have very low real interest rates. The GCC produce about 23 percent of the world's oil and controls 40 percent of the world's oil reserve. They probably feel safe from speculators because of their sizable foreign reserves. They also seem content with the fixed exchange rate regime and oblivious to asset price bubbles. Dubai and Qatar are similar to Hong Kong in many aspects.

GCC housing time series data are not available. Colliers International plots a hump-shaped housing price index for Dubai, which went from 100 in 2007 to nearly 220 in mid 2008 then took a nosedive to 100 in early 2009.

We show that, had the GCC adopted a monetary policy of targeting low domestic inflation rate, average nominal interest rate would have been higher than otherwise and average real interest rate would have been positive than otherwise, which imply that asset price bubbles could have been moderate, if not totally absent.

Next we simulate a strict and flexible inflation targeting rules. In section 3, we conclude.

2. Monetary policy simulations

The UAE and Qatar's inflation rate are low and stable during 1999-2003. They are high and more variable during 2004-2008. Oman's inflation increased significantly in 2007. Let's assume that these countries float their currencies. And, they use a "strict" and a "flexible" policy formula (Taylor 1993, 1999) to ask, what nominal short term interest rate delivers a positive real interest rate, under a specific inflation target?

The strict inflation targeting Taylor rule is:

1
$$\widetilde{i}_t = \widetilde{r} + \pi_t + 0.5(\pi_t - \hat{\pi}),$$

and the flexible inflation targeting rule is:

2
$$\tilde{i}_t = \tilde{r} + \pi_t + 0.5(\pi_t - \hat{\pi}) + 0.5(y_t - \hat{y}_t)$$

We report the results of strict and flexible inflation targeting along with descriptive statistics in tables 1 and 2. Table 1 has 6 columns for each country. π_t is in column 1. We assume that the central bank wants to keep average inflation as low as it was during the period 1999-2003 for the UAE and Qatar, and 1999-2006 for Oman. In column 2, for the UAE the target is set to 2.5 percent; 1.5 percent for Qatar. For Oman, average inflation during 1999-2006 is 0.5 percent; we chose $\hat{\pi}=1$ percent. Column 3 includes i_t (actual) followed by \tilde{i}_t (simulated) in column 4. In the last two columns we have r_t and \tilde{r} .

On average, to keep inflation low and stable, and the real interest rate is reasonably positive, the UAE would have had an average short term nominal interest rate \tilde{i}_i of 14.2 percent compared with actual i_i of 3.3 percent; 18.4 compared with actual of 4.7 percents for Qatar; and 16.2 compared with 2.6 percents in Oman. Table 2 is similar to table 1. Over time, when inflation is under control, both the nominal and real interest rates would be low. Most importantly, the variability of real interest rate, inflation and output would be significantly lower under inflation targeting.

3. Conclusion

A floating exchange rate regime with an inflation targeting policy could have moderated, if not fully prevented, asset price bubbles and stabilized output and inflation in the GCC countries UAE, Qatar and Oman. Targeting asset price bubbles by central banks directly is still debatable.

Data Appendix

Data are from IFS. UAE's interest rate are from IMF staff consultation documents. Hong Kong housing price is from HKMA.

 i_t denote nominal interest rate; for Hong Kong, money market rate. For the UAE the

91 CD rate; Repo and Bank rates for Qatar and Oman.

 π_t denotes CPI inflation rate.

 r_t denotes the real interest rate, $i_t - \pi_{t-1}$

 y_t is log real GDP.

(*) denotes US magnitudes.

(-) on variables denotes average value.

(^) on inflation denotes the target; on GDP denotes potential GDP (HP filter with $\lambda = 100$).

(~) denotes simulated value.

References

Colliers International http://www.globalpropertyguide.com/real-estate-house-prices/U

Friedman, M., 1953, The case for Flexible Exchange Rates, in <u>Essays in Positive</u> <u>Economics</u>, Friedman, M. (ed.) University of Chicago Press.

Taylor, J. B., 1993, Discretion versus Policy Rules in Practice, Carnegie – Rochester Conference on Public Policy, Cambridge, MA, MIT Press.

Taylor, J. B., 1999, A Historical Analysis of Monetary Policy Rules, in John B. Taylor ed., <u>Monetary Policy Rules</u>, Chicago: University of Chicago Press for NBER, 319-40.

	UAE								Qatar						Oman					
Year	π_t	$\hat{\pi}_t$	i_t	ĩ	r_t	ĩ	π_t	$\hat{\pi}_t$	i_t	ĩ	r_t	ĩ	Year	π_t	$\hat{\pi}_t$	i_t	\widetilde{i}_{l}	r_t	ĩ	
1999	2.1						1.7						1999	0.5						
2000	1.4		6.5		4.4		1.7		6.6		4.9		2000	-1.2		7.3		6.8		
2001	2.8		3.2		1.8		1.4		2.5		0.8		2001	-0.8		7.5		8.7		
2002	2.9		1.7		-1.1		0.2		1.7		0.3		2002	-0.3		7.5		8.3		
2003	3.1		1.0		-1.9		2.3		1.3		1.1		2003	0.2		7.5		7.8		
Average	2.5		3.1		0.8		1.5		3.0		1.8		2004	0.7		0.7		0.5		
Std	0.7		2.4		2.9		0.7		2.4		2.1		2005	1.9		3.1		2.4		
2004	5	2.5	1.7	9	-1.4	2.8	6.8	1.5	2.6	12	0.3	2.6	2006	3.2		3.6		1.8		
2005	6.2	2.5	3.9	11	-1.1	3.0	8.8	1.5	4.5	15	-2.3	2.5	Average	0.5		7.5		5.2		
2006	9.3	2.5	5.2	15	-1	2.3	11.8	1.5	5.5	19	-3.3	2.0	Std	1.4		0.1		0.8		
2007	11.1	2.5	4.5	18	-4.8	2.6	13.8	1.5	5.5	22	-6.3	2.1	2007	6.1	1.0	2.0	11	-1.2	2.3	
2008	11.5	2.5	1.4	18	-9.7	2.0	15.0	1.5	5.5	24	-8.3	2.2	2008	12.6	1.0	0.9	21	-5.2	2.6	
Average	8.6	2.5	3.3	14.2	-3.6	2.5	11.3	1.5	4.7	18.4	-4.0	2.3	Average	3.8	1.0	2.6	16.0	-3.2	2.4	
Std	2.9		1.7	4.1	3.8	0.4	3.4		1.3	4.9	3.4	0.3	Std	4.6		0.8	7.1	2.8	0.2	

 Table 1: Actual and Simulated Strict Inflation Targeting

 $-\hat{\pi}_t$ is average from 1999-2003 for UAE and Qatar. For Oman (1999-2006) we chose 1 percent as a target.

-Std is standard deviation.

				UAE							Qatar								Oman			
Year	π_t	$\hat{\pi}_t$	$y_t - \hat{y}_t$	i_t	\widetilde{i}_t	r_t	ĩ	π_{t}	$\hat{\pi}_{t}$	$y_t - \hat{y}_t$	i_t	\widetilde{i}_t	r_t	ĩ	Year	π_{t}	$\hat{\pi}_{t}$	$y_t - \hat{y}_t$	i_t	\widetilde{i}_t	r_t	ĩ
1999	2.1							1.7							1999	0.5						
2000	1.4		2.1	6.5		4.4		1.7		2.1	6.6		4.9		2000	-1.2		-2.1	7.3		6.8	
2001	2.8		-2.4	3.2		1.8		1.4		-2.4	2.5		0.8		2001	-0.8		1.0	7.5		8.7	
2002	2.9		-6.3	1.7		-1.1		0.2		-6.3	1.7		0.3		2002	-0.3		-0.7	7.5		8.3	
2003	3.1		-1.8	1.0		-1.9		2.3		-1.8	1.3		1.1		2003	0.2		-3.1	7.5		7.8	
Average	2.5		-2.1	3.1		0.8		1.5		-2.1	3.0		1.8		2004	0.7		-2.5	0.7		0.5	
Std	0.7		3.4	2.4		2.9		0.7		3.4	2.4		2.1		2005	1.9		-1.3	3.1		2.4	
2004	5.0	2.5	0.4	1.7	9	-1.4	2.5	6.8	1.5	0.4	2.6	12	0.3	2.4	2006	3.2		0.4	3.6		1.8	
2005	6.2	2.5	1.1	3.9	11	-1.1	2.4	8.8	1.5	1.1	4.5	15	-2.3	2.0	Average	0.5		-1.2	5.3		5.2	
2006	9.3	2.5	2.8	5.2	17	-1.0	2.9	11.8	1.5	2.8	5.5	21	-3.3	2.6	Std	1.4		1.5	2.8		3.5	
2007	11	2.5	1.6	4.5	19	-4.8	2.6	13.8	1.5	1.6	5.5	23	-6.3	2.3	2007	6.1	1.0	1.7	2.0	12	-1.2	2.4
2008	12	2.5	1.4	1.4	19	-9.7	2.3	15.0	1.5	1.4	5.5	25	-8.3	2.5	2008	12.6	1.0	2.7	0.9	22	-5.2	2.2
Average	8.6	2.5	1.5	3.3	15.0	-3.6	2.5	11.3	1.5	1.5	4.7	19.2	-4.0	2.3	Average	9.4	1.0	2.2	2.6	17.0	-3.2	2.3
Std	2.9		0.9	1.7	4.7	3.8	0.2	3.4		0.9	1.3	5.5	3.4	0.2	Std	4.6		0.8	0.8	7.1	2.8	0.2

Table 2: Actual and Simulated Flexible Inflation Targeting

- $\hat{\pi}_t$ is average from 1999-2003 for UAE and Qatar. For Oman (1999-2006) we chose 1 percent as a target.

-Std is standard deviation.



Previous Publications

No	Author	Title
API/WPS 9701	جميل طاهر	النفط والتنمية المستديمة في الأقطار العربية : الفرص والتحديات
API/WPS 9702	Riad Dahel	Project Financing and Risk Analysis
API/WPS 9801	Imed Limam	A SOCIO-ECONOMIC TAXONOMY OF ARAB COUNTRIES
API/WPS 9802	محمد عدنان وديع بلقاسم العباس	منظومات المعلومات لأسواق العمل لخليجية
API/WPS 9803	Adil Abdalla	The Impact of Euro-Mediterranean Partnerships on Trade Interests of the OIC Countries
API/WPS 9804	رياض دهال حسن الحاج	حول طرق الخصخصة
API/WPS 9805	Ujjayant Chakravorty Fereidun Fesharaki Shuoying Zhou	DOMESTIC DEMAMD FOR PETROLEUM PRODUCTS IN OPEC
API/WPS 9806	Imed Limam Adil Abdalla	Inter-Arab Trade and the Potential Success of AFTA
API/WPS 9901	Karima Aly Korayem	Priorities of Social Policy Measures and the Interset of Low-Income People; the Egyptian Case
API/WPS 9902	Sami Bibi	A Welfare Analysis of the Price System Reforms' Effects on Poverty in Tunisia
API/WPS 9903	Samy Ben Naceur Mohamed Goaied	The Value Creation Process in The Tunisia Stock Exchange
API/WPS 9904	نجاة النيش	تكاليف التدهور البيئي وشحة الموارد الطبيعية: بين النظرية وقابلية التطبيق في الدول العربية
API/WPS 9905	Riad Dahel	Volatility in Arab Stock Markets
API/WPS 9906	Yousef Al-Ebraheem Bassim Shebeb	IMPORTED INTERMEDIATE INPUTS: IMPACT ON ECONOMIC GROWTH
API/WPS 9907	Magda Kandil	Determinants and Implications of Asymmetric Fluctuations: Empirical Evidence and Policy Implications Across MENA Countries
API/WPS 9908	M. Nagy Eltony	Oil Price Fluctuations and their Impact on the Macroeconomic Variables of Kuwait: A Case Study Using a VAR Model
API/WPS 9909	علي عبد القادر	إعادة رؤوس الأموال العربية إلى الوطن العربي بين الأماني والواقع
1API/WPS 000	محمد عدنان وديع	التنمية البشرية ، تنمية الموارد البشرية والإحلال في الدول الخليجية
2API/WPS 000	محمد ناجي التوني	برامج الأفست : بعض التجارب العربية
API/WPS 0003	Riad Dahel	On the Predictability of Currency Crises: The Use of Indicators in the Case of Arab Countries
API/WPS 0004	نسرين بركات عـادل العلـــي	مفهوم التنافسية والتجارب الناجحة في النفاذ إلى الأسواق الدولية

No	Author	Title
API/WPS 0101	Imed Limam	Measuring Technical Efficiency Of Kuwaiti Banks
API/WPS 0102	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Internal Sustainability And Economic Growth In The Arab States
API/WPS 0103	Belkacem Laabas	Poverty Dynamics In Algeria
API/WPS 0104	محمد عدنان وديع	التعليم وسوق العمل : ضرورات الاصلاح حالة الكويت
API/WPS 0105	محمد ناجي التوني	دور وآفاق القطاع السياحي في اقتصادات الأقطار العربية
API/WPS 0106	نجاة النيش	الطاقة والبيئة والتنمية المستديمة : آفاق ومستجدات
API/WPS 0107	Riad Dahel	Telecommunications Privatization in Arab Countries: An Overview
API/WPS 0108	علي عبد القادر	أسس العلاقة بين التعليم وسوق العمل وقياس عوائد الاستثمار البشري
API/WPS 0201	أحمد الكواز	مناهج تقدير المداخيل المختلطة في الأقطار العربية
API/WPS 0202	سليمان شعبان القدسي	الكفاءة التوزيعية لشبكات التكافل الاجتماعي في الاقتصاد العربي
API/WPS 0203	Belkacem Laabas and Imed Limam	Are GCC Countries Ready for Currency Union?
API/WPS 0204	محمد ناجي التوني	سياسات العمل والتنمية البشرية في الأقطار العربية : تحليل للتجربة الكويتية
API/WPS 0205	Mustafa Babiker	Taxation and Labor Supply Decisions: The Implications of Human Capital Accumulation
API/WPS 0206	Ibrahim A. Elbadawi	Reviving Growth in the Arab World
API/WPS 0207	M. Nagy Eltony	The Determinants of Tax Effort in Arab Countries
API/WPS 0208	أحمد الكواز	السياسات الاقتصادية ورأس المال البشري
API/WPS 0209	Mustafa Babiker	The Impact of Environmental Regulations on Exports: A Case Study of Kuwait Chemical and Petrochemical Industry
API/WPS 0301	Samir Makdisi, Zeki Fattah and Imed Limam	Determinants Of Growth In The Mena Countries
API/WPS 0302	طارق نویر	دور الحكومة الداعم للتنافسية ''حالة مصر''
API/WPS 0303	M. Nagy Eltony	Quantitative Measures of Financial Sector Reform in the Arab Countries
API/WPS 0304	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Can the Sudan Reduce Poverty by Half by the Year 2015?
API/WPS 0305	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Conflict Resolution and Wealth Sharing in Sudan: Towards an Allocation Formula
API/WPS 0306	Mustafa Babiker	Environment and Development in Arab Countries: Economic Impacts of Climate Change Policies in the GCC Region
API/WPS 0307	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Globalization and Inequality in the Arab Region
API/WPS 0308	علي عبد القادر علي	تقييم سياسات وإستراتيجيات الإقلال من الفقر في عينة من الدول العربية

No	Author	Title						
	Belkacem Laabas							
API/WPS 0401	and Imed Limam	Impact of Public Policies on Poverty, Income Distribution and Growth						
API/WPS 0402	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Poverty in the Arab Region: A Selective Review						
API/WPS 0403	Mustafa Babiker	Impacts of Public Policy on Poverty in Arab Countries: Review of the CGE Literature						
API/WPS 0404	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	On Financing Post-Conflict Development in Sudan						
API/WPS 0501	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	On the Challenges of Economic Development in Post-Conflict Sudan						
API/WPS 0601	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Growth, Poverty and Institutions: Is there a Missing Link?						
API/WPS 0602	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	On Human Capital in Post-Conflict Sudan: Some Exploratory Results						
API/WPS 0603	Ahmad Telfah	Optimal Asset Allocation in Stochastic Environment: Evidence on the Horizon and Hedging Effects						
API/WPS 0604	Ahmad Telfah	Do Financial Planners Take Financial Crashes In Their Advice: Dynamic Asset Allocation under Thick Tails and Fast volatility Updating						
API/WPS 0701	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	Child Poverty: Concept and Measurement						
API/WPS 0702	حاتم مهران	التضخم في دول مجلس التعاون الخليجي ودور صناديق النفط في الاستقرار الاقتصادي						
API/WPS 0801	Weshah Razzak	In the Middle of the Heat The GCC Countries Between Rising Oil Prices and the Sliding Greenback						
API/WPS 0802	Rabie Nasser	Could New Growth Cross-Country Empirics Explain the Single Country Growth of Syria During 1965-2004?						
API/WPS 0803	Sufian Eltayeb Mohamed	Finance-Growth Nexus in Sudan: Empirical Assessment Based on an Application of the Autoregressive Distributed Lag (ARDL) Model						
API/WPS 0804	Weshah Razzak	Self Selection versus Learning-by-Exporting Four Arab Economies						
API/WPS 0805	رشا مصطفى	اتفاقية أغادير: نحو بيئة أعمال أفضل						
API/WPS 0806	Mohamed Osman Suliman & Mahmoud Sami Nabi	Unemployment and Labor Market Institutions: Theory and Evidence from the GCC						
API/WPS 0901	Weshah Razzak & Rabie Nasser	A Nonparametric Approach to Evaluating Inflation-Targeting Regimes						
API/WPS 0902	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	A Note on Economic Insecurity in the Arab Countries						
API/WPS 0903	وشاح رزاق	الأزمة المالية الحالية						
API/WPS 0904	Ali Abdel Gadir Ali	The Political Economy of Inequality in the Arab Region and Relevant Development Policies						
API/WPS 0905	Belkacem Laabas Walid Abdmoulah	Determinants of Arab Intraregional Foreign Direct Investments						
API/WPS 0906	Ibrahim Onour	North Africa Stock Markets: Analysis of Unit Root and Long Memory Process						
API/WPS 0907	Walid Abdmoulah	Testing the Evolving Efficiency of 11 Arab Stock Markets						
API/WPS 0908	Ibrahim Onour	Financial Integration of North Africa Stock Markets						
API/WPS 0909	Weshah Razzak	An Empirical Glimpse on MSEs Four MENA Countries						
API/WPS 0910	Weshah Razzak	On the GCC Currency Union						
API/WPS 0911	Ibrahim Onour	Extreme Risk and Fat-tails Distribution Model: Empirical Analysis						